

# Joint Policy & Analytics and Practice & Operations Advisory Groups Meeting Summary

June 10, 2021

The Policy & Analytics Advisory Group provides a means for the public to offer recommendations to the Workgroup about how to ensure the California Cradle-to-Career Data System supports research, evaluation, accountability, and optimization of publicly funded services at the state level.

The Practice & Operations Advisory Group provides a means for the public to offer recommendations to the California Cradle-to-Career Workgroup about how the data system could address improvement efforts at the institutional and regional level, support a case management approach to service delivery, and create tools that would be useful to students, families, and teachers.

This document provides a summary of the key points that emerged from a half-day meeting that provided an update on legislative actions, described the recommended approach to community engagement, shared information on the P20W data points, and described legal and technical documentation.

More information about the meeting, including a recording, materials referenced during the meeting, and the PowerPoint, are available at <https://cadatasystem.wested.org/meeting-information/policyanalytics-advisory-group>.

The following advisory group representatives attended the meeting:

## Practice & Operations

- Craig Hayward, Bakersfield College
- Sara Arce, Campaign for College Opportunity
- Susan Savage, Child Care Resource Center
- Anthony Dalton, Futuro Health
- Marcy Lauck and Nabil Shahin, Santa Clara County Office of Education
- Catalina Cifuentes, Riverside County Office of Education
- Heddy Nam (for David Rattray), UNITE LA
- Tyler Wu, uAspire
- Kristin Clark, West Hills Lemoore College

## Policy & Analytics

- Kristin Schumacher, California Budget and Policy Center
- Su Jin Jez, California Competes
- Evan White, California Policy Lab
- Brian Guerrero, California Teacher's Association
- Samantha Tran and Stephen Blake, Children Now
- Orville Jackson, GreatSchools.org
- Heather Hough, PACE
- Liz Guillen, Public Advocate
- Jacob Jackson, PPIC
- Angela Perry, TICAS

## Budget Update

Amy Supinger of WestEd provided a detailed summary of activities on the budget and trailer bill. The Cradle-to-Career Data System budget has been informally approved, at the same dollar values as in Governor's budget from January 2021. The legislature has also approved the release of planning funds to hire positions for the new Office of Cradle to Career at the Government Operations Agency (GovOps) and to allow WestEd to provide support during the first year of implementation. However, the request to use the remaining planning funds for a proof-of-concept teacher retention dashboard and updates to CALPADS have been pushed to the overall budget negotiation. The trailer bill language is under negotiation and the budget may still be adjusted, such as to include funding for dedicated staff positions at each of the major data providers.

## Community Engagement Subcommittee

Kathy Booth of WestEd provided an overview of the scope and deliverables of the Community Engagement Subcommittee. The advisory group members were then encouraged to give feedback on several proposals from the subcommittee.

## Governance

Kathy Booth walked through a set of recommendations related to ensuring strong community participation in the governance process. These recommendations were approved by the workgroup in their May meeting.

Liz Guillen of Public Advocates praised the way the subcommittee recommended integrating community engagement within governance processes, which reflects deep expertise on issues of equity and diversity. She intends to use the recommendations in her own work. Kristin Clark of West Hills Lemoore College, Susan Savage of CCRC, and Brian Guerrero of CTA concurred.

## Community Engagement Plan

Amy Fong of CSIS described the goals, strategies, and roles of various parties in the community engagement plan, which was also approved at the May workgroup meeting.

Kathy Booth of WestEd noted that the proposed approach will require strong partnerships with community-based organizations, such as those represented in the advisory groups. She asked advisory group members to describe the types of partnerships they imagined developing with GovOps to implement the data system.

Susan Savage of CCRC reflected that her organization would be able to share lessons learned from developing dashboards that use administrative data. In particular, she found that it is very important to develop and deploy uniform messaging on budget-related issues.

Brian Guerrero of CTA recommended that his organization work with GovOps and districts to help classroom teachers understand the potential of the data system and how they could use it. Like the School Dashboard, the Cradle-to-Career Data System could help inform Local Control and Accountability Plan (LCAP) goals, particularly regarding college readiness and understanding what happens to students after they leave a district—and particularly for tracking longer-term outcomes for middle school students.

Su Jin Jez of California Competes noted that her organization could share lessons learned when developing fact sheets that focus on specific populations of interest—such as cutting data by region or

race/ethnicity. In addition, her organization will spend this summer updating its dashboard to make information more actionable, including doing focus groups with target audiences. The information they glean could be shared with GovOps.

Angela Perry of TICAS suggested that her organization's dashboard may also be useful a reference because it was designed with similar users in mind, allows users to search at several levels of complexity, and has created topical resources.

Lorri Frangkiser-Stock, a community participant, encouraged GovOps to work with postsecondary faculty to use the data system when teaching data literacy—for example, the tools could be integrated into coursework or stand-alone modules so that more people are savvy data consumers.

Heddy Nam of UNITE-LA noted that it will be important to clarify the types of actions that GovOps is hoping community based organizations will take. It may be helpful to have GovOps connect those who are skilled at working with publicly available data with those who have a strong capacity to engage communities and conduct advocacy. GovOps should ensure that community members are being engaged, in addition to community-based organizations.

Jeanette Ellis-Royston of the NAACP Pomona Branch suggested that GovOps work with national and state-level organizations in addition to more community-based groups. The unique approach being implemented in California would be of interest to those working on similar issues in other contexts.

Orville Jackson of Great Schools underscored this point, noting how valuable the insights from the Cradle-to-Career Data System would be for K-12 leaders across the country. He is interested in developing a more specific plan for partnering with GovOps to accelerate their joint work, engage people in using the platform, and providing feedback.

Heddy Nam of UNITE-LA highlighted that the ideas developed by the Community Engagement Subcommittee are related to concepts within the Community-Based Participatory Action & Research approach. She suggested that GovOps look to that model to ensure they proceed with a coherent approach and have a continuous improvement plan. She also suggested that GovOps develop strategies for reaching community members who are not currently engaged in school, or who are more likely to be reached through mechanisms like community based organizations or student groups.

Su Jin Jez of California Competes agreed and suggested that GovOps also learn more about design-based implementation research.

### Communications Approach

Stephen Blake of Children Now walked the group through the proposed communications approach. The advisory group members were supportive of the recommendations.

### Data Points

Kathy Booth of WestEd provided an update on the finalization of which data points each data provider will share, the publishing of a document summarizing display options for all 200 data points, and work that will commence over the summer to align calculations related to employment and earnings. Finally, she noted that the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office had added one more data point on intended major.

Craig Hayward of Bakersfield College asked whether high school GPA will be included.

Kathy Booth of WestEd clarified that CDE did not feel their course-level data was of sufficient quality to include in the first year of implementation. However, part of the rationale for updating CALPADS and integrating it with the California College Guidance Initiative (CCGI) tools is that it will enable CDE to obtain high-quality data that can then be used to calculate and publish GPA information in the Cradle-to-Career Data System. Kristin Clark of West Hills Lemoore College expressed enthusiasm about this development.

Craig Hayward of Bakersfield asked for more information about the intended major data point.

Kathy Booth of WestEd responded that this is the data point indicated by students on their college applications about the specific field of study they want to pursue (such as English or welding), as opposed to their goal (such as preparing for transfer or taking classes for job training).

Craig Hayward of Bakersfield College clarified that this would be element SM/SS 02 STUDENT-CREDIT-COURSE-OF-STUDY.

Kathy Booth of WestEd agreed, but noted that the technical definition had yet to be compiled, as the data point had just been added.

Kristin Schumacher of the California Budget and Policy Center asked how the transfer of childcare programs from CDE to CDSS will impact the Cradle-to-Career Data System.

Kathy Booth of WestEd clarified that for the first several years, while CDSS is rebuilding the data systems for early learning and care information, the only information included will come from CDE.

Marcy Lauck of SVDT asked how the data elements listed as being calculated by the managing entity—such as the proportion of students completing four years of math—will be implemented.

Kathy Booth of WestEd noted that this will not require local education agencies to submit any additional data. Instead, GovOps will work with the data providers to develop a calculation from information gathered at the state level. For example, the four year of math figure might be a calculation based on course data for each student, with seniors who took math in each year of high school included in the numerator and all seniors in the denominator. Practitioners and data experts should weigh in on these calculations, as they may have insight into considerations that should be taken into account in the formula.

Susan Savage of CCRC asked whether the methodologies being developed for employment and earnings data points would be made public.

Kathy Booth of WestEd confirmed that they would be and noted that this transparency could be used to support greater alignment across analyses and data providers.

### Deidentification/Suppression Policy

Kathy Booth of WestEd described the changes to the draft deidentification policy that had been reviewed by advisory group members at their last meeting. This document has been renamed the suppression protocol to clarify that it only addresses summary data for the public tools. She also noted ways that the protocol had been modified to provide greater privacy protections.

Brian Guerrero of CTA asked about the decision to not display the number of individuals represented in data points that have fewer than 11 people.

Kathy Booth of WestEd explained that even stating the number of people could allow someone familiar with the students at an institution to figure out whose information was being represented.

### Legal and Technical Documents

Kathy Booth of WestEd walked through the privacy and security documentation that has already been approved by the workgroup and outlined the proposed model for legal agreements. She noted that work on the legal agreements will continue through the end of the month.

James Waterman, a community member, suggested reviewing the work of the California Mental Health Services Oversight and Accountability Commission, as they have successfully merged and published information derived from sensitive data sets such as mental health and substance abuse.

Jeanette Ellis-Royston of the NAACP Pomona Branch asked whether the legal agreements will be between two parties or multiple parties.

Kathy Booth of WestEd noted that several of the agreements will have multiple signatories—such as the Participation Agreement, which describes responsibilities of the data providers and the managing entity. However, in the case of the Participation Agreement, legal responsibility will be bilateral between each data provider and GovOps.

Jacob Jackson of PPIC asked whether the Legal Subcommittee had gotten to agreement on the proposed three-pronged legal document approach.

Kathy Booth of WestEd responded that the Legal Subcommittee has not yet finalized their documents, although they are close. The remaining issue is how to manage the risks and costs of data breaches.

Catalina Cifuentes of the Riverside County Office of Education raised the challenge of making data actionable. For example, high schools may strive to ensure that students going to community college are able to transfer to a four year institution, but see in the data that many students don't subsequently enroll in a four year college. What information would be available to support action planning on that finding?

Jeanette Ellis-Royston of the NAACP Pomona Branch added to this scenario by asking whether the dashboards would be helpful to evaluate proposed legislation intended to improve transfer outcomes.

Kathy Booth of WestEd clarified that there will be a dashboard specific to transfer, which will also enable the public to see other helpful data points such as the number of students who were attaining key milestones on the way to transfer. By looking at figures before and after the legislation is passed, one could evaluate whether there was any improvement. The query builder could also be used to see whether students from a specific district are making progress early in community college, such as completing math and English requirements, in addition to their transfer outcomes. However, the public tools won't show which specific students were successful or distinguish between possible causes of improved outcomes. The public tools will display trend data, and how different subpopulations of students fared, which can be used to support conversations and guide additional data collection.

### Next Steps

The meeting concluded with Kathy Booth of WestEd clarifying that the final legislative report, which will describe recommendations from the final two workgroup meetings, will be submitted on June 30. Once the budget and trailer bill are finalized, the next steps will be to appoint governing board members, hire

an executive director, and begin the procurement process. She thanked the advisory groups for the invaluable advice they provided that helped to shape the Cradle-to-Career Data System's unique model.